

TOWN OF STOUGHTON
SOUTH ELEMENTARY SCHOOL BUILDING COMMITTEE

DATE OF MEETING: **Wednesday, June 8, 2022 at 6:15 pm**

LOCATION: School Committee Conference Room
School District Central Office
31 Pierce Street, Stoughton, MA 02072

MINUTES

-Call to Order & Pledge of Allegiance

1. Public Participation (postponed to July meeting)
2. Acceptance of Minutes – April 27, 2022 Meeting
 - a. Motion to accept - Joyce Hussein; Second - Katie Pina-Enokian; Accepted unanimously
3. Owner's Project Manager Interviews
 - a. 6:20 – 6:25pm Discussion of the Interview Format and Scoring - Dr. Thomas Raab
 - i. Question #1: The OPM's job is to control costs, especially when unanticipated events occur. Give me an example of a real citation that you've encountered and how you helped keep the project on budget without sacrificing scope or quality?
 - ii. Question #2: How would you resolve any disputes between the Owner, Designer and contractor?
 - iii. Question #3: How would you ensure that the designer performs in a timely manner?
 - iv. Question #4: What would be your interaction with the School Committee and school administration during the feasibility study and design?
 - v. Question #5: Describe an incident you were involved in that did not go well. What did you learn from this?
 - b. 6:30 – 7:15pm [Committee Interview of CBRE](#)
 - c. 7:15 – 8:00pm [Committee Interview of Compass Project Management](#)
 - d. 8:00 – 8:40pm [Committee Interview of PMA Consultants](#)
4. Discussion and Vote on Owner's Project Management Candidates
 - a. Tallying and Scoring of Interview Questions
 - b. CBRE: 710 (73%) ; Compass (82%): 800; PMA: 779 (80%)
 - c. Motion to narrow to two choices made by Katie Pina-Enokian; Second- Joseph Buckley; Accepted unanimously
 - d. Discussion surrounding each of their presentations - strengths and weaknesses
 - e. Vote on a ranking system
 - i. All in favor of Compass as first choice - unanimous
 - ii. All in favor of PMA as second choice - unanimous
 - iii. All in favor of CBRE as third choice - unanimous
 - iv. Motion to enter into negotiations with Compass - Melissa Lynch; Second - Katie Pina-Enokian; Accepted Unanimously
5. Future Agenda Items / New Business

- a. Update on the timeline - after this meeting, we will move forward with a candidate and submit them next Wednesday and that will be reviewed by July 11, 2022.
6. Next Meeting Date - TBD
7. Adjourn

CBRE Interview 6:30-7:15

Presentation - 15 minutes

- Team Introductions - Mark Lydon, Chuck Adam, Mike Ensminger, Chris Tremblay, Suresh Bhatia
- Why is CBRE the right OPM for South Elementary School?
 - Unparalleled MSBA experience
 - Team has experience on more than 40 MSBA projects
 - Currently working on two elementary school projects
 - Gloucester - a consolidation of two elementary schools; single school on one site; met with some opposition to the project but were able to help work through challenges
 - Tewksbury
 - Both projects went through the study phase before COVID, but yet, they are building brand new schools with the scope and the program that was originally proposed because of diligent, cooperative, project management. Bring their experience through all of this to our project to help deliver the educational program that the community desires
 - Make sure the school (facility-wise) is able to deliver the program the community hopes for
 - Added Suresh Bhatia to the team - he has built dozens of schools in MA; these additional team members are part of the OPM team to bring their expertise to the table very early on in the project
 - Need to be more vigilant and diligent than before to establish the appropriate budget
 - Chris Tremblay was not able to be present for the meeting, but he will also be on the team.
 - One of the few OPM firms who have the capabilities to do everything in-house due to the size; also have their own educational planner on staff. Helping to design/repair the 680 schools who suffered in Puerto Rico; hear to help and lend another perspective and eye to the plan.
 - Over a billion dollars worth of experience in place for MA construction projects
 - Will work hard with you to provide all the resources you may need
 - Included in the handout given to team members was a proposed schedule based on what was in the RFS.

Question and Answer - 15 minutes

1 Gloucester Project - funded and approved prior to COVID; When the D&D estimate came in, were \$2 million dollars over budget; worked closely with the team to see first what are the easy things that we could remove from the scope and not impact the educational programs? They were able to do that - due to the fact that COVID continued, identified alternates and priorities through various meetings so that people understood that we were being vigilant regarding the budget, but sticking with the educational plan. Did not run into early anticipated issues; learned from this project how to time out the change orders/contingency.

2 Experience working in Stoughton on the Gibbons project; you resolve by having conversations and you continue the conversation until a negotiation is reached; They proactively try to limit any conflict by having staff on their team and being transparent throughout the process; establish contingency plans into the original plans

3 Treat every member of the team on an equal basis; set the expectations and schedules for everyone involved; they have deadlines to meet. Critical to push hard, work hard and monitor the schedule so there are no last minute surprises; a plan that is viable, agreeable and achievable.

4 Meet with them often and frequently; as often as necessary - they are at our disposal. If a meeting is requested, someone will be there. Transparent communication. This is important work - here to protect tax dollars. Engagement and buy-in is important - whether there are 4 people there or 100 people there, someone will be at every meeting that is requested; Project coordinators to help with social media

5 Ongoing incident - not a resolved issue yet; code interpretation regarding clearance; working hard to resolve this by gathering as much information as possible. Looking to have the result be an inexpensive fix by removing a cross brace and reinforcing the steel in certain areas which will be easier than replacing units, doors, etc. Come up with multiple solutions to present to all parties to find a solution that works for all. Gave another example of how they were able to suggest bringing 8th grade into a new high school to solve the problem

Follow Up - 10 minutes

-What does CBRE stand for? -- Coldwell Banker Richard Ellis

-Only chase projects that they want to complete and have the capability to complete; try to fit people into the appropriate geographical location. This project also fits into their schedules -- the other two projects that they have mentioned are finishing up.

-Has their been any turn over in projects that you are working on? No. The only turnover that has occurred within the group has been Chuck who joined the team a year ago. The rest of the team has been working together for over 10-12 years on average.

-Experience with redistricting: Georgetown - 2 schools at one time and had to redistrict; Maynard, Malden: redistricted the entire city; it is not their position to argue with parents, but their job to provide information to argue why it is crucial to the ed plan and cost of the project to make decisions regarding redistricting; Beverly, Tewksbury also combining and redistricting

-Gibbons involvement - OPM assigned for the roof, doors and windows

Closure - 5 minutes

Summary and Closing: Protecting tax dollars; focus on the ed plan that was envisioned so that in 10-15 years, those children will have the facility to meet the needs of the ed plan. They propose a team that makes sense. "How do we best provide the educational quality in a building?" Believe they are the only firm to look at market trends for the next few years -- report that breaks things down to the brass tacks - why is cost being affected? Aluminum.

Compass Project Management 7:15-8:00

Presentation - 15 minutes

-Introductions - 7.5 years ago we met at similar table for the SHS project; Decided to focus on the project more than dive into in-depth introductions due to the familiarity of the team.

- Tim Bonfatti - Project Director

- Domenic Tiberi - Senior Project Manager; 40 years in the business; involved with Stoughton, Marshfield, New Bedford, will be here through the entire feasibility part of the project
- Mary Kuppens - Accounting Manager; 37 different MSBA projects that they have handled the reimbursement
- George McMahan - worked in Stoughton during the project as the CSM (construction site manager); been with Compass for 4 years; currently wrapping up an elementary school in Westboro and transitioning to the Westwood elementary school; eyes, ears and feet on the ground

- Explanation of the Communications Plan and Preliminary Project Schedule that was distributed to team
- Looking at both projects for the consolidation as well as the single elementary school
- Tailoring an Ed Plan to meet the needs of the South Elementary School
- What is the best way to maintain the facilities and get the proper project for the town?
- Macrobreakdown of the timeline of the project
- Talk to the team about the issue of school consolidation: just completed a similar assignment in Westwood; Wellesley has also consolidated; Norwood; Walpole - 2 middle into one school; they have experience around the anxiety with changes like this
- Spend first few months working on the Ed Plan
- 4 Factors of consideration for consolidation: Social Emotional, Operational, Building - physical impact

Question and Answer - 15 minutes

#1 Dealing right now with an unprecedented increase in cost; costs are increasing 5% in just 6 months; hopeful that it will moderate in the timeline of this project, but once the MSBA sets the budget, that is it. They are working in Norwood and Westwood with architects to deliver a list of feasible alternatives that are more efficient and effective. They were able to get those projects back in line.

#2 Work hard to ensure that communications are very civil; privilege of being in the industry for a long time; taking a tiered approach allows for flexibility; relationships are there for them to feel comfortable making those calls; try to avoid these things from even starting - recommend to clients that they should move beyond it to keep the project moving; it isn't a win/lose situation. Set the ground rules up at the very beginning - we are a team who is cooperative; 1:1 conversations before group meetings

#3 This is also communication. Set up a template and hold them to that schedule. It is rare that they don't make the timelines and schedule that was set. One of their taglines is accountability. Don't expect people to make unreasonable commitments, but will hold them to the timeline once it is set. Talking to them daily to know where they stand.

#4 Because of the school consolidation issue, it will be more intense. Daily interaction with the district. Anticipating that there will be working group meetings on a weekly basis - bringing in principals, school committees, superintendent, operations people, etc. to make sure all people had the information they needed.

#5 Incident that most comes to mind- General Contractor went out of business in the time frame of the project during building phase; had to engage aggressively with them so that they could shift to a new contractor in the middle of the project without losing time; another example: one subcontractor was going out of business and said he had all of the material in his shop - he allowed Dom to get all the windows from the storage facility on a Saturday.

Follow Up - 10 minutes

-Chin Lin: Programming Specialist

-In Westwood, they hired a redistricting specialist - present something from a professional that is shared with the public; suggestion to do this for this project. This was well received by the Westwood community. Sensitive to the “left out” schools - you need the whole town to support the decision. Example of Wellesley: You need to be clear and communicative so that anxiety does not take over and they understand the scope of the project.

-Continuity of personnel: try to avoid this; on any projects that they have, the majority of the staff has been maintained for the duration of the project

Closure - 5 minutes

-Highlight the importance of the Community Forums; interacting with the community to speak intelligently to the public regarding the project

-Kept their commitment to the timeline of SHS and delivered upon it; project actually came in than less than projected

-Organized and orderly project to ensure that they were not impacting students and neighbors

PMA Consultants 8:00-8:45

Presentation - 15 minutes

Introductions -

Chris Carroll (Project Executive)

Walter Hartley (Project Manager)

Mark Adrean (Assistant Project Manager)

Chris Urbano (Assistant Project Manager)

-Bringing with us a team that has done a lot of elementary school work

-Team Org Chart that outlines the core team, oversight/advisory team and as-needed support team

-Subconsultant PM&C (Cost Estimating)

-Highlight their expertise that they will bring to the South project

- Architect selection to match it up to the community and project needs: schools merging, elementary experience, etc.
- Work with the committee to keep everyone informed using criteria for selection; highlighting the strengths and weaknesses of each firm to ensure the team is comfortable moving forward; committee opinions are very important
- Feasibility Study: important documents→ Ed Program, PDP & PSR, Schedule, Budget
- Community Engagement: Project Website, Social Media Accounts, Video Updates on Website and Social Media Accounts, Posters and Flyers around town, Attending community events
 - gaining community support, getting information out to the community, encourages districts to start a project website, facebook page, PMA is there to help to support that; monthly facebook tours (live feed in the buildings) in the Wareham project; open to working with the town for video tours - help to inform the community as to why this project is important
- Working currently in Easton, Rockland, Wareham
- Base Repair/Code Upgrade; Addition/Renovation Option for both Wilkins and South Elementary; New Construction Site - did GIS mapping of the area for plans of existing site and vacant school site

- Sometimes go through 12-15 options for sites; don't want to leave any stone unturned - find the best options for the town
- Team has a lot of combined experience with elementary and MSBA

Question and Answer - 15 minutes

#1 Dennis Yarmouth example - Grades 4-7 middle school; passed the vote and then were tired up in a lawsuit; resulted in 6 million dollar escalation in cost; were able to pull that project back on budget - one variation was to go back to grass field instead of turf; change/alter/cut to get things back on budget; PMA works through value management options - go line by line; scope creep; live exercise with an excel sheet that shows the target budget with over/under projections (5 times over the course of the project)

#2 Every project will have disputes with change orders. They review each change order in detail - go through documents, specifications, identify if it is on scope and at cost; if it wasn't clear -- work to mitigate the cost or use the contingency funds. PMA will step in to make sure the owner's voice is heard.

#3 Develop a Program Master Schedule - establish this early on; hard schedule and define what the requirements are; make sure that the architects are following their schedules; review documents, make sure they are meeting the milestones; detailed work plan at each phase → ask them for these prior to starting each phase; if dates are missed or adjusted, they tie them back to the schedule and push them as OPM to make sure it gets finished

#4 Effort is largely led by the architect team, but PMA would participate and send at least one person to every meeting; if there are updates once a month, someone will be there. Sit with various parties to help provide updates needed; Understand how the School Building Committee is structured and what authority they have - work within the towns bylaw parameters

#5 Boston Arts Academy: demolition of the building, uncovered asbestos materials; set project back by over 300 days; had to work with various parties to mitigate the costs/schedules to try and get everything back on track; school is opening slightly later than anticipated, shortened the impact of the delay - lesson learned: more site investigation prior; Wareham: potential Native burial ground

Follow Up - 10 minutes

-Experience with redistricting: Dennis-Yarmouth and Easton; work closely with the School Committee - community engagement is very important for changes such as this; be out with the public to show them how the design will work for them (losing the 'neighborhood' feel); counterbalance the point → leaving 1/3 of the population behind when you only do one school - loss of equity when you only build one school

- Communicate the plans well in advance - why and how of the plan needs to be presented, discussed and available
- More visibility and discussion, the better it goes

Closure - 5 minutes

- Looking to have a bond with the School Building Committee - bring a great, capable and proven team who have worked together on elementary schools
- Highlighted the MSBA Process - A Closer Look Placement that was handed out to the committee with key dates

